Building trust by delivering support, protection and justice

15 July 2024

Second draft Shadow Report Istanbul Convention First thematic evaluation

Preface

This shadow report has been compiled on behalf of the *Dutch CEDAW-Network* by a team of independent women's rights experts in the Netherlands. Many other NGOs, research and expert institutions connected to the Network also lent their expertise. The consultation process started with some interviews in May and an expert meeting on the 5th of June 2024.

The purpose of this report is to contribute to the first thematic evaluation of GREVIO, the Group of Experts on action against violence against women and domestic violence, of the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on preventing and combating violence against women and domestic violence (Istanbul Convention) in the European part of the Kingdom of the Netherlands. The shadow report follows the questionnaire adopted by GREVIO in October 2022.

The *Dutch CEDAW Network* would like to express its appreciation for the Dutch Ministry of Public Health, Welfare & Sports for providing the funds for the process in which the shadow report was produced. We would like to stress that this has not had any bearing on its content.

The shadow report was endorsed by [...] organisations working in the Dutch part of the Kingdom of the Netherlands. A list of the NGOs that signed the shadow report is included hereafter.

Introduction

We fully appreciate the efforts of the government to address violence against women and the various initiatives it takes to do so. However, we also observe a form of wishful thinking among policymakers and judges when it comes to domestic violence and other forms of violence against women. The idea persists that the Netherlands is an egalitarian country, fostering a belief that everything can and will be solved fairly. It leads to the denial of discrimination and unequal power relationships both country wide and within institutions. This translates into a gender-neutral mantra and a lack of intersectional perspective, which disadvantages women and leads to victims feeling left alone.

The overarching theme of GREVIOs first thematic evaluation round is "building trust by delivering support, protection and justice". Trust in the government, in the opinion of the NGOs, goes beyond just trusting that one is being protected. One also needs to be able to trust that policies are effective in practice, not just on paper. Moreover, building trust is a question of accessible and understandable information. Protecting women is the responsibility of the entire government at all levels and the policy on this should be clear. However, there is an overall lack of strong, nationally-led coordination and an integrated vision of violence in all its forms. This reflects a denial of the existence of systemic discrimination.

The coalition agreement of the new government³ does not contain a section on gender equality or violence against women, except for a strengthening of the approach to honour-related violence and violence against LHBTIQ+ persons. There are **deep concerns that its antimuslim and anti-migrant attitude** and policy proposals to curb migration and access to asylum will have negative consequences for the protection of violence against (migrant and refugee) women.

The government report contains a section addressing the **Caribbean part of the Netherlands** and the various projects that have been initiated in recent years. However, it is important to note that these initiatives have been slow to develop. Moreover, the government did not allocate any funding to include the Caribbean part of the Netherlands in this shadow report, and it never has before. Additionally, we observe that the Istanbul Convention has still not been ratified for the Caribbean part of the Netherlands.

¹ The term 'gender-neutral' means that something is not associated with either women or men. It may refer to various aspects such as concepts or style of language. However, what is often perceived to be gender-neutral, including in areas of statistics or dissemination of data collected in reference to a population, often reflects gender blindness in practice (a failure to recognise gender specificities). (*EIGE*); Gender-responsive policies recognises and addresses the different needs, realities, and experiences of women and men, respectively, while promoting gender equality. It emphasises the importance of considering gender roles, stereotypes, and power dynamics in policies, programs, and practices to ensure they do not perpetuate discrimination or inequality based on gender. It ensures that both women and men have equal opportunities and access to resources, services, and decision-making processes. The discrimination of women based on sex and gender is inextricably linked with other factors that affect women, such as race, ethnicity, religion or belief, health, status, age, class, caste and sexual orientation and gender identity (*CEDAW GR 28, para 18*).

² **Intersectional** refers to the fact that discrimination against women based on sex and gender is inextricably linked to other factors affecting women, such as race, ethnicity, religion or belief, health, status, age, class, caste, and sexual orientation and gender identity *(CEDAW GR 28, para 18)*.

³ Coalitiepartijen PVV, VVD, NSC en BBB (16-05-2024). Hoop, lef en trots. Hoofdlijnenakkoord 2024 – 2028. Hope, courage and pride. Outline agreement 2024-2028.

The most significant bottlenecks are:

- **Need for a nationally coordinated policy on violence against women.** There is no centrally coordinated, coherent and long-term policy on violence against women. Current implementation efforts are predominantly project-based, fragmented, funded on a short-term basis and spread across different (governmental) actors.
- **Need for better cooperation between 'care' and 'security'.** Cooperation between support & care agencies and the justice system is inadequate.
- **Inequitable funding system.** The current funding system favours large, established organisations at the expense of smaller women's organisations, particularly those representing migrants and refugees. As a result, migrant women's organisations in particular have little access to funding.
- Need for consistent monitoring and evaluation of the effectiveness of projects and policies. Monitoring and evaluation within the policy cycle is often fragmented, incomplete or not carried out at all. There is no overall monitoring of gender-based violence policies and their effectiveness.
- Need for coordinated, consistent and systematic data collection. Data collection
 on violence against women remains limited and fragmented, and data is often not
 disaggregated. This hinders a comprehensive understanding of the issue and the
 development of effective policies.
- **Shortage of shelters.** There is an urgent need to increase shelter capacity and to ensure that all women in need of shelter have access to a safe place.
- 'Family approach' neglects partner violence against women and their safety. Lack of implementation of Art. 31 and 51 in decisions regarding custody and visitation rights; risk assessments are no standard procedure.
- Inadequate response to complaints about gender-based violence; need for 'safe reporting' policies. The number of incidents of violence reported to the police is significantly lower than the actual number of cases due to fear of victims for negative consequences and a lack of expertise on gender-based violence within the police and judicial system.

PART I: Changes in comprehensive and coordinated policies, funding and data collection in the area of violence against women and domestic violence

Article 7: Comprehensive and coordinated policies

Lack of coordinated, coherent and long-term policy

Policies on violence against women and domestic violence lack national cohesion and integration, a long-term vision and an integrated and intersectional perspective. The Ministry of Health, Welfare and Sport (VWS) has overall responsibility ('system responsibility') but lacks authority over other ministries and local government partners. VWS sets general frameworks and subsequently delegates implementation to municipalities, resulting in a multiplicity of local policies that lack national coherence, consistency and integration.4 Implementation is organised and funded on a project-by-project basis, as testified by the many examples in the government report of projects that either run for just two years or that have already ended (Art. 7, Q.1).5 As a result, implementation of the Convention is fragmented and lacks coherence, with much left to the local level. Among other things, this leads to variations in the number and support of shelters between municipalities and a highly fragmented policy. Moreover, impact measurement and evaluation of projects is often lacking, which means that the results of programmes are not financially or otherwise secured or even proven effective. An example is the national action program against domestic violence "Violence does not belong anywhere" ("Geweld hoort nergens thuis") which ran from 2018 -2021. The results were promising, but the programme was not followed up with adequate capacity and funding, nor were the results evaluated and used to develop future projects.

Another example is the National Action Programme Sexual Transgressive Behaviour and Sexual Violence (Nationaal Actieplan Aanpak Seksueel Grensoverschrijdend Gedrag), which aims to dismantle the culture of gender stereotyping and abuse of power that leads to sexually transgressive behaviour and sexual violence. However, although its term has been extended to December 2026, the program remains temporary and is constrained by limited resources. NGOs call for a long-term extension of the National Action Programme, the inclusion of an intersectional lens, and a broadening of its scope to include all forms of violence against women to strengthen the mandate of the government 's Independent Commissioner.

A further example is the 'Organisation support landscape for abuse and violence in dependency relationships' mentioned in the government report, as many victims have problems finding their way to the right help in the maze of telephone numbers, websites, etc. (see also SR Article 20). It is laudable that the government aims to address this problem, but again the project only runs for just a bit more than a year (2023-2024).

⁴ Dutch Network CEDAW (04-07-2024). *Mind the gap: addressing policy gaps in women's rights.* Dutch NGOs shadow report for CEDAW.

⁵ When referring to the Government Report, 'Art.' refers to the Article of the Istanbul Convention and 'Q.' to the question in GREVIO's questionnaire. When referring to 'SR Article', we refer to the comments in the Shadow Report under the Article concerned.

In addition, policies continue to pay more attention to physical violence than to psychological violence. To address this shortcoming, the Netherlands should **not only formally adopt the Istanbul Convention's definition of violence**, as it declares, but also implement corresponding policies.

On the positive side, there is a **slow process of moving from gender-neutral policies and protocols to gender-sensitive policies** in certain areas, such as the Plan of Action against Femicide. However, the 'gender impact' quality criterion previously included in the Regulatory Impact Assessment has disappeared from the newly adopted Policy Compass as a standalone gender assessment. It has been integrated in a mandatory assessment guide where gender impact is just one of the questions. This makes it weaker than a stand-alone gender assessment, and there is a risk that if the initial question of whether or not the policy has a gender impact is answered in the negative, no further gender impact assessment will be undertaken.

Lack of focus on women's rights and their empowerment in approach to complex divorces

The program "Violence does not belong anywhere" ("Geweld Hoort Nergens Thuis") ran from 2018 until the end of 2021. The programme was promising, however, it was not aligned with the programme 'Divorce without damage' ('Scheiden zonder schade') on so-called 'complex divorces'. The latter programme aimed to prevent harm to children as a result of parental divorce. It was strongly based on a 'family approach' and focused on cooperation between parents and the importance of children maintaining contact with both parents. It did not pay attention to situations of child abuse, partner/domestic violence, coercive control or stalking by the (ex)partner. As a result, violence against women and children by (ex-)partners is not taken into account and women are pressured to maintain contact with the perpetrator at the expense of their safety and that of children.

Without measuring the program's results, "Violence does not belong anywhere" turned into "Future outlook on children- and family protection" to further develop a family-focussed approach with the definition of "family" itself appearing rigid and lacking room for, for example, LGBTI+ families. This shift only **diverts attention further away from partner violence and women's rights** (see also Art. 31 & 48.). The "Future outlook on children- and family protection" also lacks a gender-sensitive and intersectional approach.

Safety first agenda

The national development agenda "Safety First" (Veiligheid Voorop) aims to strengthen cooperation between the care system and criminal justice partners in addressing domestic violence and child abuse. However, in some regions, the responsible municipalities are not allocating funds to "Safe at Home" (Veilig Thuis) to participate in these pilots.

Moreover, signals of abuse to different agencies and poor cooperation between agencies can lead to inaction, with sometimes disastrous consequences, as testified by a recent case of

⁶ '<u>Divorce without damage</u>' is a joint program of the Ministry of Justice & Security, the Ministry of Public Health, Welfare and Sports (VWS), the Association of Municipalities (VNG) and the Council of the Judiciary.Ministerie van Justitie en Veiligheid (03-2022). <u>Eindrapportage: Scheiden zonder Schade</u>. Ministry of Justice and Security. *Final report: Divorce without Damage*.

serious child abuse in a forster family.⁷ The case seems to be representative of a **pattern of inadequate supervision and protection of children placed out of home, lack of support for foster parents, and decentralisation of youth care, coupled with budget cuts.** Previous research on violence against children in youth care has already pointed to the need for better supervision, adequate funding, appropriate pay and training for youth care staff, and more contact time between child and the youth care-guardian so that signals of violence are timely identified and acted upon.⁸

Definition of violence Art. 3 Istanbul Convention

According to the government report (Art. 7, Q. 2), the government has fully adopted and aligned policies with the definitions of domestic violence and violence against women of Art. 3 of the Istanbul Convention. However, policies against gender-based violence refer to the definition in the Istanbul Convention, but do not fully adopt it. Economic violence or psychological violence, for example, are under-recognised, as are combinations of forms of violence. This is relevant, such as in the case of humanitarian residence permits for migrant spouses who are victims of domestic violence, and who are denied continued residence, because of the IND's limited interpretation of domestic violence (see also Article 12).⁹

For a discussion of the harmful practices action plan and online violence against women see SR Article 12 resp. SR Article 56.

New developments

'Child benefits affair'

A glaring example of government violence and self-reliance policies are the victims of the so-called 'child benefits affair', predominantly low-income women from migrant backgrounds who were falsely accused of child benefit fraud and had to unjustly pay back thousands of euros to the tax authorities. As a result, many of them were thrown into deep poverty, had their children taken away from them, or lost their homes. Due to the policy of 'self-reliance,' they were not entitled to legal aid and had to fight the state apparatus on their own. In some cases, the financial problems acted as a catalyst for partner violence or exacerbated existing situations of violence, while their 'debt' to the tax department made it impossible for women to leave a violent partner, especially when children were involved. Currently, the implementation of compensation is very slow.

New guideline 'Working for Safety'

A new guideline, "Working for Safety", was published in Spring 2024. The guideline sets out standards for municipalities to commission local teams and has been aligned with the "Future

⁷ The girl herself, the neighbours and the school had given several signals of abuse to the various child protection and guardianship authorities involved as well as to the police, but in the end no one intervened. NOS (31-05-2024). *Inspectie start onderzoek naar zorg mishandeld meisje Vlaardingen. Inspectorate starts investigation into care of abused girl in Vlaardingen.*

⁸ Commissie aanpak geweld in de jeugdzorg (12-06-2019). <u>Onvoldoende beschermd. Geweld in de Nederlandse jeugdzorg van 1945-heden</u>. Insufficiently protected. Violence in Dutch youth care from 1945 to the present.

⁹ de Hart, B., & Arbaoui, Y. (2023). <u>De afhankelijke verblijfsvergunning van vrouwelijke</u> <u>huwelijksmigranten in het lichten van internationaal recht</u>. Asiel & Migrantenrecht, 9, 432-440. Insufficiently protected, The dependent residence permit of female marriage migrants in the light of international law.

outlook on children- and family protection" programme. The risks of this approach is that municipalities may have overly high expectations of both local teams and the Future outlook, while in practice the **quality of these local teams differs widely**. In some municipalities, it seems to be used as a justification for cuts in ambulatory services from specialised organisations, such as women's shelters.

New report on stalking

The Inspectorate of Justice and Security recently published a report entitled 'Stalked. Seen. Heard?" ("Gestalkt. Gezien. Gehoord?"). The report shows that **victims often feel unheard and struggle with the lack of a single point of contact** within the police and prosecution service. The report also shows that stalking is often not recognised as such. This highlights a **gap in knowledge about gender-based violence among police and prosecutors**. A gap that may result from generalists carrying out assessments immediately following reports when a specialist assessment is needed. This is important as stalking is considered a significant predictor of femicide.

Action plan 'Together against trafficking'

The action plan 'Together against Human Trafficking' lacks a coherent and coordinated approach that puts the human rights of victims at the centre. Access to assistance and temporary residence permits is conditional on the victim's willingness to cooperate in the criminal investigation rather than on their need for support and protection. Their right to remain in the Netherlands depends on the perpetrator's conviction. There is no specific legal provision on non-punishment. The willingness of victims to report is low, as are the prosecutions and conviction rates 11, especially in cases of labour exploitation outside of the sex industry. The action plan focuses primarily on the sex industry, although 40% of all reported exploitation cases take place in other sectors 13, such as care & domestic work and the cleaning & agricultural sector. However, there is no data broken down by gender and sector. The Dutch Labour Inspectorate identifies only 7% of cases of labour exploitation outside of the sex industry due to inadequate training and lack of capacity, 14 and the burden of proof is extremely high in these sectors. 15

¹⁰ Nationaal Rapporteur Mensenhandel en Seksueel Geweld tegen Kinderen (07-02-2024). <u>Gebrek aan regie en prioriteitstelling in actieplan Samen tegen Mensenhandel</u>. National Rapporteur on Human Trafficking and Sexual Violence against Children. *Lack of direction and prioritisation in action plan Together against Human Trafficking*. Accessed 10 February 2022.

¹¹ Nationaal Rapporteur Mensenhandel en Seksueel Geweld tegen Kinderen (18-102023). <u>Jaarcijfers Mensenhandel 2022</u>. National Rapporteur on Human Trafficking and Sexual Violence against Children. *Annual figures on human trafficking 2022*.

¹² GRETA - Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (2023). <u>Evaluation Report Netherlands: Third evaluation round - Access to justice and effective remedies for victims of trafficking in human beings.</u>

¹³ Comensha (06-07-2023). <u>Mensenhandel in Nederland: Het beeld van 2022</u>. Human trafficking in the Netherlands: The image of 2022, p.6.

¹⁴ Nationaal Rapporteur Mensenhandel en Seksueel Geweld tegen Kinderen (26-04-2023). <u>Intensivering aanpak mensenhandel blijft nodig.</u> National Rapporteur on Human Trafficking and Sexual Violence against Children. *Intensifying approach to human trafficking remains necessary.* Accessed on 10 February 2022.

¹⁵ Rijken, C., de Volder, e. (08-2022). <u>Arbeidsuitbuiting onder de loep. Een analyse van de uitleg van arbeidsuitbuiting in Nederland</u>. Labour exploitation under the microscope. An analysis of the

Increase in violence against women during and after COVID-19

The impact of the COVID-19 pandemic has been particularly severe for women, yet the **gendered impact has been largely overlooked** by the government, both during the pandemic and in recovery policies, with the exception of some ad hoc measures against domestic violence.¹⁶ Surprisingly, the government has claimed that gender-based violence against women and girls did not increase during the COVID-19 pandemic¹⁷, despite a global rise in reports of domestic and sexual violence.¹⁸ This contrasts with the Safe at Home (Veilig Thuis) organisations, which reported an **increase in the number of violent incidents**.¹⁹ Additionally sex workers health organisations and researchers have reported an increase in violence against sex workers.²⁰

In particular, marginalised and disadvantaged groups of women working in typically female-dominated informal labour sectors, such as sex workers and (undocumented) migrant domestic and care workers, were hit hard. Sex workers, for example, were not allowed to work during lockdowns, but were also largely ineligible for government assistance. As a result, many of them saw no alternative but to continue working illegally. This made them targets for violence and robberies as clients and criminals knew they could not go to the police. In the first year of Covid, 55% of sex workers continued to work illegally, rising to 90% in 2021. Of these, 40% were exposed to physical or sexual violence.²¹ Additionally, the government's submission of the COVID-19 recovery plan to the EU's Recovery and Resilience Facility²² does not address gender issues and fails to adequately prioritise women in economic stimulus packages.

Article 8: Funding

The current funding landscape is **fragmented and project-based**, which hampers multisectoral collaboration, coherence and achieving and sustaining results. Different funding

explanation of labour exploitation in the Netherlands. Tilburg University & Impact: Center against Human Trafficking and Sexual Violence in Conflict, pp.35-39.

¹⁶ Dutch Network CEDAW (04-07-2024). *Mind the gap: addressing policy gaps in women's rights.* Dutch NGOs shadow report for CEDAW.

¹⁷ Helmich, D.W. (10-06-2021). <u>Domestic Violence and COVID-19 in The Netherlands: A Case of (Im)Possible Framing?</u> News, Utrecht University. Accessed 22 April 2024.

¹⁸ Atria (1-11-2022). <u>Vrouwen harder getroffen door coronamaatregelen</u>. Women hit harder by corona measures. Accessed 2 July 2024.

Ministerie van Volksgezondheid, Welzijn en Sport (14-01-2021). <u>Stijging van acute meldingen bij Veilig Thuis</u>. Ministry of Health, Wellbeing and Sports. *Increase in urgent reports at Safe at Home*.
 Cubides Kovacsics, M. I., Santos, W., & Siegmann, K. A. (2023). <u>Sex workers' everyday security in the Netherlands and the impact of COVID-19</u>. Sexuality Research and Social Policy, *20*(2), 810-824.; Kloek, M., Waterman, L., Anonieme Sekswerker, Spek, E., Hendriks, S., Luhrs, Y. van Wees, D., Hontelez, J. A. C. (2021). <u>Onderzoek naar de impact van corona op sekswerk in Nederland</u>. Research into the impact of corona on sex work in the Netherlands. SoaAids Nederland & Erasmus MC.; Van Stempvoort, M. (2021). <u>Hoe de Nederlandse overheid sekswerkers kwetsbaar maakte tijdens de eerste golf van de COVID-19 pandemie</u>. Tijdschrift Voor Seksuologie, 45(1). How the Dutch government made sex workers more vulnerable during the first wave of the COVID-19 pandemic.;
 Kloek, M., Waterman, L., Anonieme Sekswerker, Spek, E., Hendriks, S., Luhrs, Y. van Wees, D., Hontelez, J. A. C. (2021). <u>Onderzoek naar de impact van corona op sekswerk in Nederland</u>. Research into the impact of corona on sex work in the Netherlands. SoaAids Nederland & Erasmus MC.
 European Commission (n.d.). *Netherlands' recovery and resilience plan*. Accessed 22 April 2024.

streams are not aligned and are managed by different ministries, leading to silos in financing. Furthermore, funding mechanisms largely exclude small (migrant) women's organisations.

In addition, the decentralisation of various government tasks to municipalities (e.g. youth care), often without adequate funding or even with budget cuts, has added to fragmentation, local variations in available services and barriers to tackling problems that transcend the local level. Projects are being implemented locally without overarching coordination, a lack of monitoring and accountability, and there is no system to track how funds are spent across municipalities.

As to the provision of adequate and sustainable financial and human resources to women's rights organisations providing specialist support, see SR Article 22. Contrary to what the government report suggests, the eight alliances mentioned do not provide direct specialist support services to victims, but focus primarily on prevention and awareness-raising (Art. 8, Q. 5).

Article 11: Data collection and research

NGOs, GREVIO and the CEDAW Committee have frequently pointed to the lack of coordinated and systematic data collection by the Dutch government on violence against women, including by type of violence and by groups of victims, such as women with disabilities. Despite these concerns, data collection remains fragmented, carried out separately by different organisations and according to different criteria. Data is often not gender disaggregated and the relationship between different data sets is not clear.²³ In addition, the various data collection initiatives appear to focus mainly on the prevalence of violence and victims, rather than on perpetrators and the effectiveness of interventions to stop violence, protect victims and support their recovery and prevent perpetrators from re-offending.

Gender-responsive policies and programmes still lack the gender-disaggregated data needed to address multiple and intersecting forms of discrimination and to monitor progress towards substantive gender equality. Contextual data is also often lacking. The Dutch government should proactively mainstream data collection and systematically collect disaggregated data to assess the impact of policies and their development. It is also important that data is not only collected, but also visible and publicly accessible to NGOs, researchers and the general public. Of particular concern is the structural lack of data collection in the Caribbean under the guise of 'privacy protection'.

Movisie & I&O research (GLBTIQ+ people); Pharos (harmful practices); Public Prosecutor's Office (female victimisation); CBS (female emancipation); University Leiden Surveillance and Security Threats Monitor 2022-2023 (relational violence).

²³ To illustrate, the government report lists many different organisations who collect data: CBS & WODC (domestic violence and sexually transgressive behaviour); law enforcement and judiciary (domestic violence and child abuse); police (incidents of victimisation); Safe Home (child abuse and domestic violence)): National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings and Sexual Violence against children (victims and perpetrators); I&O Research (sexually transgressive behaviour); Panteia,

PART II: Information on the implementation of selected provisions in priority areas in the field of prevention, protection and prosecution

Prevention

Article 12: General obligations

Addressing harmful gender stereotypes

Although the government's report emphasises its responsibility to tackle social inequality through cultural change, which requires a wider social debate (Art. 12, Q. 9a), its approach is fragmented, lacks inclusiveness and leaves interpretation to third parties. A more systematic, coordinated, long-term and proactive strategy is needed to effectively and sustainably eliminate harmful stereotypes and stereotypical gender roles.

Unfortunately, in some cases the government itself perpetuates stereotypes through its policies and actions, as highlighted in the 2018 Dutch NGO Shadow Report on the Istanbul Convention. For example, violence against black, migrant and refugee women is often categorised as a cultural issue that requires a gender and culturally sensitive approach, while violence against white women does not receive the same consideration. Similarly, the persistent association of migrant and refugee women with oppression and harmful practices reinforces stereotypes. Under the heading of 'harmful practices', the government report itself, for example, only lists harmful practices within migrant communities (Art. 7, Q. 1), while practices such as forced conversion therapy for homosexuals, non-medically necessary surgery on intersex children without their consent, the pathologization of transsexual women and the requirement of some Christian reformed schools for children to declare their sexual orientation are not listed. This reinforces the stereotype that harmful practices only occur in migrant communities. (for a more detailed discussion of harmful practices, see the dedicated paragraph below.

Furthermore, despite positive initiatives to address the stigmatisation of sex workers and to improve their social and legal status,²⁵ existing legislative proposals for forced registration of sex workers and mandatory interviews to determine their 'resilience' (Wrs/Wgts, see also SR Art. 56) cast **sex workers as powerless victims in need of state control**. This reinforces negative stereotypes of sex workers and contributes to stigma and social exclusion, which rather than protecting sex workers increases the risk of violence.

In addition, victims are frequently portrayed as impoverished, lacking in education, weak or damaged, thereby perpetuating the stereotype of the "ideal victim". The **stereotype of the**

²⁴ Dutch CEDAW Network (10-2018). <u>Joining forces to break the circle of violence against women.</u>
Dutch NGO Shadow Report on the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on preventing and combating violence against women and domestic violence (Istanbul Convention), p.10.

²⁵ Ministerie van Justitie en Veiligheid en Ministerie van Sociale Zaken en Werkgelegenheid (11-2023). <u>Aanpak versterking sociale en juridische positie sekswerkers</u>. Ministry of Justice and Security and Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment. *Approach to strengthening the social and legal position of sex workers*.

"ideal victim" often determines who is considered deserving of victim status and worthy of help.²⁶ This is particularly common in cases of sexual violence, for example when the victim is perceived as lacking the necessary (sexual) 'innocence'. Research shows that when victims of sexual violence fit the profile of the ideal victim, they are more likely to get help and compassionate responses, as they "did not deserve what happened to them".²⁷ The ideal victim plays a pivotal part in the reactions of others and frequently results in a lack of recognition and support for those who do not conform to this mould. According to available data, those who do not fit the stereotype do not receive the help they expect. Instead, their attempts are met with doubt, an "if it is true ... it is your own fault" trope. These reactions do not include only blaming and shaming but also redefine the experience and victim status.

Another example, as highlighted in the 2018 Dutch NGO Shadow Report on Istanbul Convention, are integration courses for migrants and refugees, aimed at introducing them to Dutch culture, which often portray an image of the Netherlands from about 50 years ago. These courses frequently **emphasise traditional gender roles**, where men are expected to work and pursue careers while women are encouraged to focus on childcare and household duties. The NGOs have observed a comparable pattern in relation to female refugees, noting that women receive less support in terms of job opportunities and pursuing education compared to their male counterparts.

Need for programmes specifically addressing prevention of gender-based violence

In the government report, the government outlines several campaigns aimed at raising awareness about gender-related violence (Art. 12, Q. 9c). While promoting gender equality and women's (financial) independence is important, there is also a need for more initiatives that specifically address gender-based violence and emphasise prevention strategies from a clear gender perspective. This includes addressing factors that put women and girls in a position of dependency, for example on partners in the case of dependent residence permits, on carers in the case of elderly women, or in institutions in the case of women with disabilities.

Prevention also means that **all women should always feel safe to report violence** without fear of negative consequences, such as deportation in the case of undocumented women, the loss of their children in the case of partner violence, or fines and eviction in the case of unlicensed sex workers, and that they can rely on being taken seriously and treated with respect (See SR report Art. 49 & 50).

Moreover, with the recent amendment of the Sexual Offences Act, it is crucial to **educate boys and men** that recognizing and communicating boundaries and desires is not only vital for preventing violence but also enhances the quality of relationships and sexuality.

Research also indicates a widespread **lack of knowledge about different forms of gender-based violence**, such as stalking and coercive control by (ex)partners, and methods to

²⁶ Eelmaa, S., & Murumaa-Mengel, M. (06-2022). *Who is worthy of help? Constructing the stereotype of the "ideal victim" of child sexual abuse.* In Child sexual abuse and the media pp. 261-278.

²⁷ Krahé, B., Temkin, J., Bieneck, S., & Berger, A. (2008). *Prospective lawyers' rape stereotypes and schematic decision making about rape cases.* Psychology, Crime & Law, 14(5), pp. 461-479.

recognise and prevent violence, as well as a tendency to trivialise various forms of violence among the Dutch population.²⁸

Meaningful participation

Organisations such as police, youth agencies and **informal organisations should be involved in the development**, monitoring and evaluation of prevention policies. The same applies to meaningful participation of the groups and communities prevention policies aim to reach, including women with a disability, migrant communities, sex workers, and other groups. This will enhance the quality of policies, ensure that they are relevant to the realities of the communities concerned and avoid (unforeseen) negative side effects.

Need for independent reporting centres

As mentioned in the government report in the framework of strategic alliances, in recent years, there has been increased attention on preventing sexual harassment in sports (Art. 7, Q. 1), which has led to amendments to disciplinary laws. Changes include revision of statutes of limitations, implementation of mandatory reporting, and enhancing reporting mechanisms.²⁹ Also, **objective investigation of incidents shows to be paramount**, particularly due to the significant number of reports received. This highlights the importance of independent reporting centres, such as the Dutch Centre Safe Sports (Centrum Veilige Sport Nederland)³⁰ and emphasises the need for continuous and systematic reporting of violence, alongside securing sustainable funding to sustain these efforts. If it is possible to effect change in this area, it should also be possible in other areas.

<u>Prevention of violence against groups that are specifically at risk of intersectional discrimination</u>

In general, paying attention to groups especially at risk of intersectional discrimination is all the more important as there is a general **lack of awareness and understanding of the intersectional dimensions of violence** among government officials and social workers.

Women with a dependent residence permit

As discussed in previous shadow reports to GREVIO and CEDAW, research shows that the legal dependency of their partner puts migrant women with a dependent residence permit at a greater risk of violence. Legal dependency reinforces unequal power relations, traditional gender roles and stereotypes, and hinders women's personal autonomy. In theory, women can apply for an independent residence permit on humanitarian grounds before the mandatory 5-year period in case of violence. In practice, however, there are so many obstacles that it is almost impossible to obtain such a permit. On average, there are no more than 180 applications for continued residence on the grounds of domestic violence per year,

²⁸ UN Women Nederland (11-2023). <u>Actiepunten voor een gecoördineerde en effectieve aanpak van gendergerelateerd geweld. Orange the world</u>. UN Women Netherlands. Action Points for a coordinated and effective response to gender related violence.

Centrum Veilige Sport Nederland (2022). <u>Jaarverslag 2022 Centrum Veilige Sport Nederland</u>.
 Centre for Safe Sports Netherlands. Annual Report 2022 Centre for Safe Sports Netherlands.
 Centrum Veilige Sport Nederland (n.d.). <u>Grensoverschrijdend gedrag</u>. Centre Safe Sports Netherlands. <u>Unacceptable behaviour</u>. Accessed 2 July 2024.

out of an average of 12,000 marriage migrants per year.³¹ Given the prevalence of domestic violence in Dutch society and the experience of civil society organisations, this is only the tip of the iceberg. According to research, the low number of applicants mainly reflects the **inadequacy of the current policies to protect women from violence**. The three main barriers to women accessing independent residence permits after domestic violence are reporting the break-up of the relationship to the IND (with the attached risk of deportation), the limited interpretation of the definition of domestic violence, and uncertainty about the burden of proof.³²

In addition to abolishing or shortening the period of dependency, the definition of domestic violence should be brought into line with the Convention, the current barriers to obtaining an independent residence permit in cases of domestic violence, such as the high burden of proof, should be removed, and access to information on the possibility of obtaining an independent permit should be improved.

Women with disabilities

Women with disabilities are at greater risk of violence, exploitation and abuse compared to other women.³³ This is particularly the case for women and girls functioning at the level of mild intellectual disability.³⁴ Women with mild intellectual disabilities are more likely to be victims of sexual violence, with 61% reporting having experienced some form of it.³⁵ Therefore, it is crucial to pay extra attention to women with disabilities when addressing (sexual) violence against women. Furthermore, the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities calls for the meaningful participation of women with disabilities in policy-making on (sexual) violence. However, the Dutch government is currently failing to fulfil this requirement.³⁶

Furthermore, women with intellectual disabilities residing **in care homes** are **insufficiently protected** from sexual violence within these institutions. The same can be said of women with an intellectual disability **in prisons**. In the recruitment, selection and training of prison workers,

³¹ De Hart, B., Arbaoui, Y. & Verweij, E. (2022). <u>Heb geduld: De betekenis van het afhankelijk verblijfsrecht in het dagelijks leven van huwelijksmigranten en hun partners</u>. Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam VU. Be patient: The Meaning of Dependent Residence Rights in the Daily Lives of Married Migrants and their Partners.

³² De Hart, B., Arbaoui, Y. & Verweij, E. (2022). <u>Heb geduld: De betekenis van het afhankelijk verblijfsrecht in het dagelijks leven van huwelijksmigranten en hun partners</u>. Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam VU. Be patient: The Meaning of Dependent Residence Rights in the Daily Lives of Married Migrants and their Partners.

³³ Mans, L. (2024). <u>Dubbel benadeeld: Een overzicht van knelpunten en discriminatie van vrouwen en meisjes met een beperking in Nederland vanuit intersectioneel perspectief</u>. Dutch CEDAW Network. Double disadvantaged. An overview of bottlenecks and discrimination against women and girls with disabilities in the Netherlands from an intersectional perspective.

³⁴ Landelijk Kenniscentrum LVB. <u>LVB & Uitbuiting</u>. National LVB Knowledge Center. *LVB and exploitation*. Accessed 2 July 2024.

³⁵ Van Berlo, W., de Haas, S., van Oosten, N., van Dijk, L., Brants, L., Tonnon, S., & Storms, O. (2011). <u>Beperkt weerbaar. Een onderzoek naar seksueel geweld bij mensen met een lichamelijke, zintuiglijke of verstandelijke beperking.</u> Utrecht: Rutgers WPF/MOVISIE. *Limited resilience. A study into sexual violence among people with a physical, sensory or intellectual disability.*

³⁶ Rijksoverheid (07-12-2022). <u>Beantwoording List of Issues VN-verdrag Handicap</u>. Dutch government. *Answers List of Issues UN Convention on Disability*.

there is no consideration given to the specific needs of female prisoners, nor to the importance of a balanced composition of male and female prison staff.³⁷

Elderly women

In 2023 Safe at Home (formerly: Support Centre for Domestic Violence) received 1703 reports of elder abuse.³⁸ Previous research showed that **70 per cent of reports related to female victims**.³⁹ As the population ages, this group will inevitably expand, particularly given that women tend to live longer than men on average. Elder abuse encompasses a range of forms, including physical, sexual or psychological abuse, neglect, financial exploitation and violation of rights, e.g. deprivation of mail. In about half of the reported cases, the perpetrator is a child, grandchild or (ex-)partner. Additionally, instances of unintentional violence perpetrated by overburdened informal carers have been documented. Exploratory research by 2023 shows that **little is currently done with reports and that many social workers are not equipped** to deal with them properly. This is also due to the way help is organised: there are too few face-to-face contacts and help is fragmented across different organisations.⁴⁰

More attention should be paid to education on preventive measures, such as preventing the isolation of older people, preventing the overburdening of informal carers and better equipping care workers to deal with elder abuse. The latter is particularly urgent given the ageing population, the fact that many informal carers are already overburdened, the closure of old people's homes and the policy of keeping older people at home for as long as possible. In addition, more research is needed to gain a better understanding of the nature and extent of the problem.

In addition, **older undocumented (single) women face increasing care needs**, declining incomes and increasing dependency on others. Returning to their country of origin is often not a viable option after living and working in the Netherlands, sometimes for decades. Although long-term care is theoretically available, this is not always clear to professionals or tailored to the specific needs of this group. It also depends on the willingness of care organisations to accept undocumented migrants. The lack of rights and protection for a growing number of women increases the risk of violence.

Muslim women

Islamophobia is on the rise in the Netherlands⁴¹ and in its wake **discrimination and violence against Muslim women**, especially if they wear headscarves. NGOs are extremely concerned about the new Minister for Asylum and Migration, who openly supports replacement theories and declared that she is "not into headscarves" and would like Muslim women "to

³⁷ Vaste commissie voor Justitie en Veiligheid, <u>Verslag Commissiedebat 4 juli 2023</u>, Kamerstukken II, 2022–2023, 24 587, nr. 918. Commission for Justice and Security. *Report Commission Debate*, Parliamentary Papers Second Chamber.

³⁸ Ensink, B., Nieuwenhuis, M. (2024). <u>'Ouderenmishandeling' treft vooral vrouwen (concept)</u>. WOUW Amsterdam; Landelijk Platform Bestrijding Ouderenmishandeling. *Elder abuse mainly affects women (concept)*.

³⁹ Movisie (2011). Registratie Ouderenmishandeling 2011. Elder Abuse Registration 2011.

⁴⁰ Kriek, F. Oude Ophuis, R.J.M. (2023) <u>Een verkennend onderzoek naar ouderenmishandeling</u>. Amsterdam, Regioplan publicatie nr. 1019. *An exploratory study of elder abuse.*

⁴¹ College voor de Rechten van de Mens (18-01-2024). <u>Moslimdiscriminatie in Nederland</u>. Netherlands Institute for Human Rights. *Anti-Muslim discrimination in the Netherlands*. Accessed 2 July 2024.

throw away their head scarfs and get a taste of freedom.⁴² In a recent Parliamentary debate the prime minister even felt compelled to assure a female Member of Parliament who wears a headscarf that "he sees her as a human being"⁴³

LGBTIQ persons

Research by the Social and Cultural Planning Office (SCP)⁴⁴ shows that lesbian, gay and bisexual people are more likely to be a victim of violent crimes, disrespectful behaviour, hacking and cyberbullying than heterosexuals. LGBT pupils in primary and secondary schools are at greater risk of being bullied and of becoming victims of violence. Bisexual persons, LGB young people and LGB persons with a migration background are in an especially vulnerable position when it comes to safety. Although the safety situation of lesbian women and gay men has improved, this is not the case for bisexual persons. In particular, bisexual women are more often victims of sexual violence. As many as one in three have been a victim of physical sexual violence in the past five years. Less than a quarter of LGBTI individuals in the Netherlands have ever reported a physical or sexual assault to the police. Since 2006, prejudice, stigma and negative stereotypes against LGBT people have decreased, but there has been little or no increase in acceptance in recent years.

Intersex people are at increased risk of violence. The most recent EU LGBTIQ survey⁴⁶ conducted in 2023 by the EU Fundamental Rights Agency, shows a **large increase in physical and sexual attacks experienced by intersex people**. Less than one in five of the respondents had reported the most recent incident to any organisation. Additionally, the survey reveals a troubling rise in hate-motivated harassment against intersex individuals in their daily lives. The percentage of intersex respondents experiencing hate-motivated harassment in the 12 months before the survey increased from 42% in 2019 to 74% in 2023. Overall, 61% of the respondents say that violence against LGBTIQ people has increased.

Sex workers

Research shows that sex workers are exposed to high levels of violence, often stemming from the stigma attached to sex work.⁴⁷ This includes physical and sexual violence, but also financial-economic violence, such as clients stealing their money or refusing to pay, and social-emotional violence, such as intrusive and unwanted questions, harassment and humiliation, as well as invasion of their privacy and stalking. For many sex workers, stigma is the key reason why they choose to remain anonymous. By keeping their work as hidden as

⁴² NOS (04-07-2024). <u>Premier Schoof meteen onder vuur van oppositie, maar ook van Wilders</u>. Prime Minister Schoof immediately under fire from the opposition, but also from Wilders. Accessed 4 July 2024.

⁴³ RTL (4 July 2024). <u>Tranen in de Tweede Kamer</u>. *Tears in the Second Chamber of Parliament.*⁴⁴ SCP (2022). <u>LHBT-monitor 2022. De leefsituatie van lesbische, homoseksuele, biseksuele en transgender personen in Nederland</u>. The living situation of lesbian, homosexual, bisexual and transgender persons in the Netherlands.

⁴⁵ Van den Broek, A., Ramakers, C., Cuppen, J., Brukx, D. (2022). <u>Veilig op school. Landelijke veiligheidsmonitor 2020-2021. Veiligheidsbeleid en veiligheidsbeleving in het primair en voortgezet onderwijs</u>. Nijmegen: ResearchNed. Safe at school. National safety monitor 2020-2021. Safety policy and safety perception in primary and secondary education.

⁴⁶ FRA (2024). <u>LGBTIQ Equality at a Crossroads: Progress and Challenges</u>. EU LGBTIQ survey III. Country Data – Netherlands. Access 4 July 2024.

⁴⁷ SoaAids, Aidsfonds, Proud (2018), *Sex Work, Stigma and Violence against Sex Workers in the Netherlands.*

possible, they try to prevent violence against them and protect their families. Other factors include (il)legality, location of the workplace and whether they work in a licensed setting. Very few sex workers report violence to the police. Rather than protecting sex workers, laws and policies on sex work negatively impact their safety and significantly raise the threshold for reporting crimes, particularly because of their focus on combating trafficking and unlicensed prostitution and the sharp decline in the number of licensed workplaces. In addition, for sex workers who wish to work independently, it is almost impossible to do so in the licensed sector. As a result, many sex workers work outside the licensed sector, which increases the risk of violence and exploitation.

Harmful practices

Overall there is a **lack of coherent and integrated policies to address the correlation between harmful practices**. Research shows that women who experience one form of harmful practice often experience other forms of gender-based violence (such as honour-based violence, child and early forced marriage, marital captivity, (online) sextortion, forced abandonment, female genital mutilation, domestic violence and child abuse).⁴⁸ There is an urgent need for coherent policies that address the relation between the different forms of violence, the groups affected and their social, legal and economic position. Data collection is fragmented and carried out separately by different organisations.

The 'Harmful Practices Action Plan' only ran from 2020-2022 (Art. 7, Q. 1) and as such is another example of **short term, project based policies.** It is not clear in what way the program provides a 'solid base' for current and future strategies and how it will be followed up.

The Action Plan mentions cultural mediators in migrant organisations as important actors in reaching out to migrant communities. Nevertheless, it is not clear whether and how they are or will be structurally embedded in professional organisations and funded, assuming that they should not work for free. In general, **funding mechanisms exclude small migrant women's organisations.**

Moreover, the action plan had a limited focus and **did not pay attention to harmful practices that occur throughout Dutch society,** in particular forced conversion therapy for gay people (which is still legal in the Netherlands), non-medically necessary surgery on intersex children without their consent (see SR Article 20(24) on consent, sterilisation and abortion), the pathologisation of transgender and non binary people, and schools that demand a so-called 'identity declaration' from pupils as part of their fight against homosexuality.⁴⁹

In the case of marriage coercion and forced abandonment, there is money to arrange reception abroad, return documents, and support on return to the Netherlands. However, this

⁴⁸ European Commission (2023). <u>Towards the elimination of female genital mutilation</u>. Final Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council, European Commission. Brussels, 25.11.2013 COM(2013) 833.

⁴⁹ Ministerie van Onderwijs, Cultuur en Wetenschap (28-03-2023). <u>Antwoorden op schriftelijke vragen over het feit dat veel reformatorische scholen nog altijd homoseksualiteit afwijzen en identiteitsverklaringen hanteren</u>. Ministry of Education, Culture and Science. *Answers to written questions about the fact that many reformed schools still reject homosexuality and use identity declarations.*

is not communicated to either women themselves or support organisations. Nor is it published on the websites of the National Centre for Forced marriages and Abandonment (LKHD). The new bill to modernise the trafficking article in the Criminal Code recognises forced marriage and marital exploitation as a form of trafficking. This is an important step forward. However, women and girls who escape after years of forced abandonment abroad risk having lost their Dutch nationality due to their prolonged involuntary stay abroad. This means that if the period of abandonment has lasted too long it is not possible anymore for them to return to the Netherlands. Despite the recognition of forced marriage as a form of trafficking, the bill to revise the Nationality Act on Dutch citizenship (RNW) does not take these situations into account and should be adapted to ensure that all victims of forced abandonment can return to the Netherlands. Furthermore, there is still a need for consular and legal support abroad for women trapped in marital captivity to process their divorce in their country of origin.

There is a policy and some money available for **hymen repair surgery**, but not all operations are reimbursed and the criteria for eligibility are vague, so it is rarely used in practice.

For women who are threatened with **femicide** in another country, the Netherlands still does not provide a safe haven.

Article 14: Education

Sexuality education under pressure

Comprehensive sexuality education needs to be improved both within and outside schools and should include more information about sexual orientations and gender identity. Additionally, there is a need for more comprehensive information on intersecting forms of discrimination, violence against women, and emerging types of online gender-based violence. However, **sexuality education has come under attack**. Political opposition and misinformation campaigns are actively targeting the "Spring Fling" ("Lentekriebels") project week, during which schools focus on relational and sex education in a manner tailored to their specific needs. Many schools, particularly in the final years of primary education, also incorporate gender education into the curriculum. The project week itself has existed for nineteen years; however, the political resistance is new and can be seen as part of the trend of sexual and reproductive rights coming under pressure.

Lack of quality standards for sexuality education

In her advice to the Minister of Education, Culture, and Science, the government commissioner for sexual transgressive behaviour and sexual violence stresses that comprehensive sexuality

⁵⁰ Femmes for Freedom (n.d.). *Femmes for Freedom - Defending Girls and Women's Rights.* Access 4 July 2024.

⁵¹ Femmes for Freedom (22-07-2024). <u>Waarom Femmes for Freedom het meldpunt verdwenen vrouwen opricht</u>. Why Femmes for Freedom launches the missing women hotline. Access 2 July 2024

⁵² Rutgers (2022). <u>Manifest voor betere seksuele vorming</u>. Manifesto for better sex education.

⁵³ Rutgers (24-03-2023). <u>Roerige Lentekriebelsweek levert vooral veel waardevolle gesprekken op.</u> Turbulent 'Spring Fling' mostly yields many valuable conversations. Accessed 22 April 2024.

education should have a permanent place in higher education.⁵⁴ Schools in the Netherlands are obliged to give attention to comprehensive sexual education, however, they are free to choose how they address the topic, thereby missing a major prevention opportunity. Moreover, there is currently **no standardised system of quality standards for sexuality education**. Additionally, it is crucial to develop a similar system of quality standards for civic integration courses designed for migrants and refugees.

Lack of education on gender based violence

The importance of sexuality education cannot be understated, not only because children and young people develop a positive self- and body image through good relational and sex education but also because they learn to treat themselves and others respectfully, including saying no to unwanted touches or actions.⁵⁵ However, there is an additional **need for education on gender-based violence**, as it can play an important role in preventing such violence. Currently, there is no standard requirement to include education on gender-based violence in schools alongside sexuality education. Despite efforts to develop educational materials on this topic that have been put into practice, the government has not created a policy to make this mandatory.

Article 15: Training of professionals

As highlighted in the 2018 Dutch NGO Shadow Report on the Istanbul Convention, there is currently no standardised national policy for regular and mandatory training for professionals dealing with gender-based and domestic violence.⁵⁶ This approach poses significant challenges for institutions with high staff turnover, such as healthcare facilities or asylum seekers' centres. These institutions often experience ongoing depletion of skills and expertise that remain unaddressed.

Furthermore, the Dutch government should make training on what constitutes gender based violence mandatory among judges, prosecutors, civil servants, and other agencies due to a glaring lack of knowledge. Significantly, **judges and immigration officers are among the groups for whom training is not mandatory** (Art. 15, Q. 11). Emphasis should be placed on adopting a gender-sensitive approach throughout these training initiatives. Notably, judges undergo training at an independent institute where there is little room for training from external experts in gender-based violence.

In addition to these measures, there is a recognized **need to increase NGO involvement** and incorporate "experts by experience" into training programs for professionals. This is necessary to incorporate sensitivity to cultural differences in training programs for professionals, particularly because women with a migration background face a higher risk of

⁵⁴ Regeringscommissaris seksueel grensoverschrijdend gedrag en seksueel geweld (2024). <u>Advies over de aanpak van seksueel grensoverschrijdend gedrag en seksueel geweld in hoger onderwijs en wetenschap</u>. The special government commissioner for sexual misconduct and sexual violence. Advice on tackling sexual misconduct and sexual violence in higher education and science.

⁵⁵ Lauwers, L., Van Reeuwijk, M., Leusink, P., Beek, T. (02-2024). <u>Achtergronddossier: Relationele en seksuele vorming</u>. Rutgers. *Background file: Relational and sexual education.*

⁵⁶ Dutch Network CEDAW (04-07-2024). *Mind the gap: addressing policy gaps in women's rights*. Dutch NGOs shadow report for CEDAW.

experiencing gender-based violence. Moreover, training on primary prevention, before any violence has occurred, is equally important and should be a mandatory part of professional training.

Article 16: Preventive intervention and treatment programmes

There are programmes to prevent perpetrators from re-offending, such as buddy and peer programmes, but they are unevenly distributed across the country. A more coherent policy is needed. Equally **important is addressing problematic masculine behaviour patterns** to prevent violence from occurring in the first place. Currently, masculinity is not addressed in government policies, which are gender-neutral (as discussed under SR Article 7). **Primary prevention tends to focus mainly on minorities with migration backgrounds**, such as in the case of harmful practices. Prevention and education programs should include addressing problematic masculine behaviour; otherwise, the root cause of violence against women will not be addressed.

Protection

Article 18: General obligations

Top-down policies addressing violence against specific groups

Policies addressing violence against specific groups often follow a top-down approach, where **affected groups** such as black, migrant, and refugee women, as well as sex workers, **are not consulted or included in the policy-making process**. This exclusion is particularly noticeable among vulnerable and marginalised communities. As a result, their experiences and expertise are often overlooked or even disregarded, which may lead to less effective policy outcomes and risks having unexpected and/or undesirable side effects.

Challenges in the development of multi-agency cooperation mechanisms

Lack of integrated vision and multi-agency cooperation

Women's shelter organisations observe that domestic violence manifests in various patterns, each with a different background and requiring distinct approaches. It is crucial to address these issues in an integrated and systematic manner to develop sustainable solutions to combat violence against women. Multi-agency cooperation mechanisms involve collaboration with the mental health care and support services in areas such as debt, housing, parenting skills, and addiction. Despite the integrated approach that is described in the government report (Art. 18, Q. 15a), organisations face several bottlenecks and issues in developing multi-agency cooperation mechanisms, Challenges include lack of continuation of (successful) projects/programmes due to financial silos between departments, inadequate funding models (as described below), lack of investments by municipalities and long waiting lists that hinder effective collaboration between different care facilities, delaying timely interventions.

Funding model favours large organisations

The government's funding model tends to **favour large**, **non-gender-specific organisations** at the expense of small women's organisations, especially those representing black, migrant

and refugee women, women with disabilities, and those reliant on volunteers. As a result, current policies fall short of facilitating meaningful and sustainable participation.⁵⁷ Small community organisations, which play a crucial role in reaching marginalised women, are not adequately integrated into the chain approach.

Problematic collaboration between "formal" and "informal" organisations

Informal organisations possess invaluable knowledge, are trusted by the communities they are part of, and serve as crucial intermediaries between formal support systems and survivors. However, informal care organisations are often overstretched and collaboration between formal and informal organisations faces significant challenges. For example, communication problems and language barriers between these groups hinder effective coordination. In addition, informal care providers are often undervalued and their insights disregarded by professionals in formal organisations who perceive them as lacking sufficient expertise. When informal organisations draw attention to problems or mistakes in the work of formal organisations, their feedback is often not valued, making future collaboration more difficult.

Article 20: General support services

In general, government policy places a strong **emphasis on so-called 'self-reliance'** of citizens. This basically means that women are expected to be able to seek help and change their situation on their own. However, not all women, particularly those from marginalised groups, and not all victims of violence are equally 'self-reliant', which can prevent them from accessing appropriate support.

Access to care

Contrary to what the government report suggests (Art. 20, Q. 22), **not all women victims of violence have equal access to care and support**. This particularly concerns women with disabilities, women in dependent relationships, women from migrant and refugee backgrounds, women in asylum procedures, undocumented women, victims of coercive control/intimate terror, and elderly women. Some victims do not dare or are ashamed to ask for help or to report the violence, can't find the way or are not reached by support services. In other cases, the support services offered do not meet their needs, lack knowledge about their specific background, or fail to take the violence committed against them seriously. Additionally, common policies may exclude certain categories of victims from accessing resources such as shelters.

Access to interpretation

In the case of migrant women, lack of access to interpreters can be a barrier to accessing help. Until 2012, social and health workers could use a free state-funded interpreter, but this was abolished because the government expects people living in the Netherlands to learn Dutch. Since then, reimbursement of interpreters is limited to victims of trafficking, asylum seekers in reception centres and women in crisis shelters.⁵⁸ In other cases,

⁵⁷ Dutch Network CEDAW (04-07-2024). *Mind the gap: addressing policy gaps in women's rights.* Dutch NGOs shadow report for CEDAW.

⁵⁸ Artsenfederatie KNMG (02-05-2022). *Tolken in de zorg. Interpreters in the medical care sector.*

reimbursement rules vary according to the type of professional and client group, and in many cases care providers have to pay for an interpreter themselves.⁵⁹ Several organisations have called for a more comprehensive and cross-sectoral national regulation covering all care providers.

Fear of loss of children in case of domestic violence

A common complaint of victims of domestic violence is the **lack of attention** paid to **violence against women by ex-partners, especially when children are involved.** Victims of domestic violence who have (young) children are often reluctant to contact youth services or organisations that are (or are perceived to be) in contact with the Child Protection Council for fear of losing their children. If the violence they experienced is taken seriously, mothers are often judged for not leaving their aggressive partners sooner and accused of endangering their children by staying in the relationship. However, if the violence they have experienced is not taken seriously, youth services routinely insist on the importance of contact between the children and the perpetrator and pay little attention to the safety of the victim. Mothers often feel abandoned by the system that should offer them protection (see also 'Women victims of coercive control').

Women with disabilities60

Research indicates that not every municipality provides the required specialised support and care for girls and women with disabilities who are victims of domestic and sexual violence. One **problem is the accessibility of shelters** for women with disabilities. This includes a lack of information on websites regarding the (physical) accessibility of these facilities, as well as accessibility issues with the websites themselves. According to information from the Alliance on the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD), women with intellectual disabilities residing in care facilities who are victims of violence struggle to find their way to police or social workers. 62

NGOs note a **lack of understanding about migrant women with disabilities**, who may face increased risks of domestic violence and social isolation due to taboos surrounding disability within their family and communities. This creates additional barriers to accessing necessary support and care.⁶³

Women in relationships of dependency

_

⁵⁹ Pharos (01-2022). <u>Infosheet: Tolken in de zorg</u>. Factsheet: Interpreters in the medical care sector.

⁶⁰ This section is based on Mans, L. (2024). <u>Dubbel benadeeld: Een overzicht van knelpunten en discriminatie van vrouwen en meisjes met een beperking in Nederland vanuit intersectioneel perspectief</u>. Dutch CEDAW Network. *Double disadvantaged. An overview of bottlenecks and discrimination against women and girls with disabilities in the Netherlands from an intersectional perspective.*

⁶¹ De Vaan, K., Harthoorn, H., Martina, K. (2021). <u>Gendersensitiviteit in de Nederlandse aanpak van huiselijk geweld: nadere concretisering van de GREVIO-aanbevelingen</u>. Regioplan. Gender sensitivity in the Dutch approach to domestic violence: further concretization of the GREVIO recommendations.
62 Alliantie VN-Verdrag Handicap (2019). <u>Schaduwrapportage Verdrag inzake de rechten van personen met een handicap in Nederland</u>. Alliance UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD). Shadow report on the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in the Netherlands.

⁶³ Dutch CEDAW Network (30-03-2023). <u>The NGOs' comments on the reply of the Netherlands to the reporting form on the implementation of the Recommendation of the Committee of the Parties n 30 January 2020 (IC-CP/Inf(2023)3).</u>

Recent research indicates that despite the wide array of services available, only a small fraction of victims of violence in dependency relationships are reached.⁶⁴ Examples are, abuse of elderly people, human trafficking and exploitation, but also sexual transgressive behaviour at sports or hobby clubs. Intimate partner violence, child abuse and sexual violence also fall under this heading. As recognised in the government report for many victims, finding the right help is a complex and lengthy process (Art. 7, Q. 1). Navigating through a maze of phone numbers, websites, and information services proves daunting. There is a need for making information easier accessible. Victims would greatly benefit from having a support person or buddy to guide them through this process. This individual could be an expert by experience, someone from their personal network or a trained professional. Cultural mediators (a buddy with the same cultural, linguistic and or religious background with knowledge of the systems) could be of great added value for migrant women. Experts by experience can also significantly reduce barriers for seeking help and should be a standard offering. Furthermore, once victims reach out, help should be readily accessible without waiting lists, repeated intakes and referrals from one organisation to the next (see also SR Article 20(18)).

Women victims of coercive control

Current guidelines and protocols within child welfare, child protection and family law services often do not adequately address cases of intimate partner violence/coercive control ('intimate terror') that continues after separation as Post Separation Abuse (PSA). The experience of many mothers is that these guidelines and protocols actually perpetuate the abuse, facilitate the perpetrator's coercive control over the victim, and often re-traumatise and re-victimise the mothers and their children over a long period of time. They often feel victimised by the very institutions that are supposed to protect and help them. As highlighted by GREVIO in its 2020 baseline report (paras. 201-204), intimate partner violence and PSA are rarely taken into account in decisions on custody and visitation rights, even in cases where judges have found that violence has occurred. The consequences of domestic violence and its effects are often misunderstood or underestimated by judges, or it is wrongly assumed that the violence will stop after the divorce. Women are often pressured to "forget the violence" and "cooperate" under threat of being seen as 'obstructive' or malicious and losing custody of their children. Also the argument of 'parental alienation' is frequently (ab)used to silence women, as is also signalled by the UN Special Rapporteur on Violence against Women.65

A key concern is the requirement for mothers to continue to communicate with the perpetrator, a stipulation found in all guidelines and directives of youth welfare and child protection services. Rather than seeing PSA as contra-indication, mediation-like trajectories are structurally and frequently imposed. Too often, situations of coercive control and PSA are not recognised and treated as 'high conflict divorces', in which both parents are equally responsible and actively harming the children.

⁶⁴ Wildt, R. de., Steketee, M., Compagner, M. (2023). <u>Laagdrempelige hulp voor slachtoffers en plegers van geweld in afhankelijkheidsrelaties</u>. Utrecht: Verwey-Jonker Instituut. *Accessible help for victims and perpetrators of violence in dependency relationships*.

⁶⁵ Alsalem, R. (13-04-2023). <u>Report of the Special Rapporteur on violence against women and girls, its causes and consequences: Custody, violence against women and violence against children</u>. (A/HRC/53/36).

Women from migrant and refugee backgrounds

Women from migrant and refugee backgrounds often face significant barriers in accessing appropriate care. They, for example, do not make use of the Sexual Assault Centres or Safe at Home organisations. Barriers include challenges such as lack of culturally-sensitive services and inadequate knowledge about legal aspects related to (lack of) migration status. This makes key community figures and self-organisations indispensable partners in reaching out to these groups as they possess valuable skills, networks, and cultural competences that formal aid organisations may lack internally. It is essential to enhance the diversity and inclusivity of healthcare service staff, and to recognize and compensate key community figures. Improving structural collaboration between formal and informal organisations is also vital. There is a need for more accessible assistance, for instance in peer-to-peer groups.

Women in asylum centres

Women in asylum centers (AZCs) often hesitate to report incidents of physical or sexual harassment, and even rape, to the police due to **fears that lodging a complaint could negatively impact their asylum process**, thereby limiting their access to appropriate care. ⁶⁶ Yet, estimates indicate that a significant proportion - ranging from 63 to 80 percent - of women from refugee backgrounds have experienced sexual violence. ⁶⁷ This violence can occur in their country of origin, during the protection, or upon arrival in the host country where they seek protection. However, there remains limited understanding of the profound implications of the physical, psychological, and sexual violence endured by refugee women. Research conducted by Amnesty and the Institute for Human Rights and Medical Research (iMMO) shows that women seeking asylum in the Netherlands, who have potentially experienced sexual violence, face a risk of re-traumatization within the asylum procedure. ⁶⁸ On the whole, **asylum procedures in the Netherlands are neither gender-sensitive nor traumasensitive, and do not take women's rights sufficiently into account.**

As highlighted in the Dutch Shadow Report on the CEDAW Convention in 2021, the **lack of psychosocial support** exacerbates the trauma of women who have experienced conflict-related sexual and gender-based violence.⁶⁹ Despite access to (specialised) healthcare (Art. 20, Q. 23), as stated in the government report, ensuring adequate and continuous care becomes challenging, if not impossible due to the **frequent transfer of asylum seekers from one centre to another.** Although mandatory safety protocols exist for these centres, not all have effectively implemented them. There is also a lack of centralised government coordination to systematically monitor the implementation and effectiveness of social safety policies within AZCs.⁷⁰

⁶⁶ CEDAW (21-07-2021). <u>List of issues and questions prior to the submission of the seventh periodic report of the Netherlands.</u>

 ⁶⁷ Donse, A., Safi, M. (2023). <u>Blinde vlek in asielprocedure? Slachtoffers van seksueel geweld</u>.
 Tijdschrift Asiel & Migrantenrecht, nr. 5. <u>Blind spot in asylum procedure? Victims of sexual violence</u>.
 ⁶⁸ Amnesty International (2023). <u>Seksueel geweld: blinde vlek in de asielprocedure.</u> Victims of sexual violence: blind spot in the asylum process.

⁶⁹ Women, Peace and Security - NAP (2021-2025). <u>Fourth Dutch National Action Plan on the implementation of UNSCR 1325 and successive resolutions</u>, p.64.

⁷⁰ Central Agency for the Reception of Asylum Seekers (COA) (2020). <u>Rapport Sociale veiligheid van</u> bewoners. Report Social safety of residents.

In its baseline report in 2020, GREVIO criticised the Dutch government for **lacking gender-sensitive guidelines** regarding the application of the Convention relating to the Status of Refugees.⁷¹ More specifically, GREVIO highlighted the absence of gender guidelines or training within the Dutch Immigration and Naturalisation Service (IND) for conducting interviews in a gender-sensitive manner. The European Asylum Agency (EUAA) provides training courses such as 'Interviewing Vulnerable Persons' and 'Interviewing Techniques', but does not specifically offer training on interviewing victims of sexual violence.

Art. 20 (18) Programmes aimed at recovery

Effective support aimed at recovery requires coordination of the different types of services and support needed, both in terms of time and sequence. Unfortunately, this **coordination** is frequently **hindered by separate funding streams for different types of assistance and lengthy waiting lists for specialised help** (see also SR Article 18).

When victims of domestic violence stay in shelters, they frequently accumulate additional debts. Managing child benefits and other social benefits is complex and time-consuming. There is a lack of continuity in social benefits and care, forcing women to restart bureaucratic procedures after leaving the shelter. Although the Housing Act gives municipalities the power to provide urgency to vulnerable groups, it is often difficult to find safe and affordable housing after shelter. Moreover, not all municipalities make use of this option. **Programs designed to enhance economic independence after (domestic) violence are insufficient and lagging behind.** The Dutch Women's Council (Nederlandse Vrouwen Raad) and Valente developed programmes to support women rebuilding their lives, such as "A New Future", but their implementation depends on whether municipalities choose to invest in them. We are also concerned that women in shelters are accumulating debt because they have to pay their own contribution while their regular housing costs also continue, a practice that is contrary to GREVIO guidelines.

Art 20 (19). Access to health care

For undocumented women structural barriers to access to health care and specialised care include the fact that only what is covered by basic health insurance is reimbursed by the Central Administration Office (CAK). Moreover, this requires a referral from a general practitioner, but it is difficult for undocumented women to find a general practitioner. GPs are often unaware of the possibility of reimbursement by the CAK. In addition, undocumented women are excluded from population screenings, such as breast and cervical screening.

Art. 20 (24). Consent, sterilisation and abortion

Officially, sterilisation, abortion or other irreversible treatments or operations on individuals with disabilities, as well as intersex persons, do not take place without their free and informed consent. However, **intersex children are still subjected to so-called 'normalising' medical treatments without their consent.** Research shows there are over 1,000 surgeries every year, alone for children under 12 years old.⁷² Dutch legislation, particularly regarding proxy consent in relation to the child's right to an open future, bodily integrity, and self-determination,

⁷¹ GREVIO (2020). <u>Baseline Evaluation Report Netherlands</u>, para 310.

⁷² Leemrijse, C. en S. v. Dulmen (2022). <u>Genitale operaties bij kinderen met DSD jonger dan 12 jaar.</u> Utrecht, Nederland, Nivel. *Genital surgery in children with DSD under 12 years of age.*

violates international and supranational law despite recommendations by the CEDAW⁷³ and CESCR⁷⁴ Committees. The UN Committee against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child have called for a ban on these treatments until children are old enough to decide for themselves. The Dutch organisation on sex diversity NNID calls for non-consensual and non-necessary medical treatments and interventions to be included in the penal code in a similar way to FGM.⁷⁵

Several court cases revealed the prescription of **forced contraception in closed juvenile care homes**. ⁷⁶ A practice which according to the Supreme Court imposes more restrictions on patients than the law allowed. ⁷⁷

Article 22: Specialist support services

Significant investments are made in the "front door" services like Safe at Home and the Local Teams, but there is a **noticeable shortage of specialised services** "behind the front door", such as specialised counselling and trauma-sensitive treatment within women's shelters. There are also long waiting lists, which make it difficult to coordinate the various specialist services.

From 2022, shelters are able to use the expertise platform "Drakentemmers", a platform with specialists in trauma and attachment after domestic violence. However, funding for these functions is temporary and uncertain. Structural problems include the **project-based and temporary nature of funding**, partly due to financial divisions between different ministries and programs, and the lack of secure continuation of successful projects. This situation forces shelters to constantly seek resources to sustain important and effective programmes. For instance, the Safety Net programme on online violence by ex-partners, is struggling to secure funding. Moreover, the decentralisation of services has led to significant regional disparities. These variations mean that the availability and quality of support can differ widely depending on where victims are living.

Article 25. Support to victims of sexual violence

⁷³ CEDAW/C/NLD/CO/6.

⁷⁴ E/C.12/NLD/CO/6.

⁷⁵ Van der Have, MJ. Misvattingen over intersekse (2023). <u>Op weg naar wettelijke regulering</u> <u>geslachtsbevestigende behandelingen intersekse personen.</u> Nijmegen, Nederland: Stichting NNID. Towards legal regulation of gender-affirming treatments for intersex people.

⁷⁶ Pointer (03-02-2022). <u>Gedwongen anticonceptie in gesloten jeugdzorg: 'Als je het niet nam, waren er zeker consequenties</u>'. Forced contraception in closed youth care: 'If you didn't take it, there were certainly consequences. Accessed 2 July 2024.

⁷⁷ Mans, L. (2024). <u>Dubbel benadeeld: Een overzicht van knelpunten en discriminatie van vrouwen en meisjes met een beperking in Nederland vanuit intersectioneel perspectief.</u> Dutch CEDAW Network. Double disadvantaged. An overview of bottlenecks and discrimination against women and girls with disabilities in the Netherlands from an intersectional perspective.

⁷⁸ Drakentemmers (n.d.). <u>Expertiseplatform trauma & gehechtheid na huiselijk geweld</u>. Expertise platform on trauma & attachment after domestic violence. Accessed 6 July 2024.

Structural shortage of shelter capacity

There is a **systemic shortage of shelter capacity** in the Netherlands. While the Minister of Health, Welfare and Sport (VWS) acknowledges this issue, both the national government and local authorities are relying on each other to propose a solution. According to the government, it provides financial resources to the municipalities to solve the problem. However, municipalities argue that these resources are insufficient. Increasing the number of shelters is especially critical for vulnerable groups such as migrant, refugee and low-income women who may lack a support network.

According to GREVIO and CEDAW guidelines, access to a safe shelter should be available to all women at all times, not only in situations of immediate physical danger or when a woman cannot find a safe place within her own network. Apart from the lack of shelters, The Netherlands fails to meet this criterion in a number of ways:

- **Undocumented women are denied access to shelters** unless they are in immediate physical danger. Shelters are only accessible to women who are applying for a residence permit or are in the process of doing so, not to those whose application has been rejected or who do not (or cannot) apply.
- Access to shelters is problematic for women with a dependent residence permit. Organisations lack adequate knowledge of migration law, which leads to women being refused access to some shelters on the grounds that they "have no right to it". This has consequences for the women concerned: to qualify for a continued residence permit, a declaration from a women's shelter is essential.

Article 31: Custody, visitation rights and safety

The determination of custody and visitation rights of children

The legislative measures described in Article 31 of the Istanbul Convention which addresses the consideration of violence in decisions regarding custody and visitation rights, are not implemented in the Netherlands. Currently, as stated in the report by the government of the Netherlands, there is **no legal framework in place for family judges to systematically consider partner violence in their assessment of cases** (Art. 31, Q. 32). Safety assessments are not made at all, **judges often assume that partner violence ends after the end of a relationship**, thereby regularly violating not only Article 31 but also Article 51(1) of the Istanbul Convention.⁷⁹ GREVIO has previously criticised the Netherlands for not integrating domestic violence adequately into family law, but the government has still not taken the required legislative amendments.⁸⁰

The **pro-contact culture (contact with both parents)**, plays a central role in the determination of custody and visitation rights of children in the Netherlands. Contact is only prohibited if it is deemed unsafe for the child, and this determination is not made lightly. The safety of the victim-parent plays little role in this assessment. There is no consideration of

⁷⁹ Avontuur, I., van Hoof, M-J. (14-06-2024). <u>Gezag en omgang in de context van dwingende controle/intieme terreur</u>. Nederlands Juristenblad, afl. 21. Authority and intercourse in the context of coercive control/intimate terror.;

Lünnemann, M., Lünnemann, K., Compagner, M. (2024). *Vadercontact in de opvang*. Verwey-Jonker. *Father contact in the shelter,* pp. 24-25.

⁸⁰ GREVIO (2020). Baseline Evaluation Report Netherlands, pp. 43-44.

whether these decisions might endanger her and/or the child(ren)'s safety.⁸¹ Judges have a glaring lack of knowledge about domestic violence and coercive control despite its significant impact in complex divorce cases. In the government report it is stated that judges "have sufficient knowledge nor can they be taken for they are independent" (Art. 31, Q. 33a), however, in order to make an independent assessment of complex divorce cases, gender sensitive knowledge about domestic violence is a prerequisite. Judges, child custody boards, family guardians, and lawyers almost universally lack knowledge about domestic violence. There are few courses available on the subject, and training in this area is not mandatory. The Council for Child Protection (Raad van de Kinderbescherming) and Youth Protection (Jeugdbescherming) also lack the necessary knowledge to recognize coercive control.

There is **limited understanding within the Council for Child Protection about gender-based violence or coercive control**, and their reports and recommendations often lack an analysis of the violence that occurred. For example, mothers are required to give 'emotional consent' for contact, even in cases involving an abusive father. Consequently, the Council for Child Protection rarely prioritises domestic violence in its court recommendations, which are nevertheless uncritically adopted by judges.

The biggest problem regarding the involvement of youth protection/care organisations is their **exclusive focus on the importance of parents' communication**, which is emphasised in all guidelines regarding high-conflict divorces. Rather than taking into account the coercive behaviour of the perpetrator and its effect on the mother and the children as an explanation for the ongoing problems between the parents, and thus focusing on the role of the perpetrator, youth care workers see improved communication as the sole solution and thus focus on the victim, who is often for obvious reasons very reluctant to meet and talk with her ex-partner. Often, the victim is pressured to participate in mediation or joint therapy sessions with the perpetrator in a way that goes counter to the provisions of the Istanbul Convention.

Moreover, vague language is used to describe violence in family law cases, for example: "there was violence between the parents", rather than "the husband abused the wife". This is especially prevalent in court decisions and reports drafted by the Board of Child Protection. Similarly, the concept of "high conflict divorces" suggests equal share by both parents in the conflict, which does not accurately reflect the dynamics of abuse and power imbalances in such situations. Generally, there is a lack of specific details regarding the actions and perpetrators. This fits the image of the idea where two fight, two are to blame. Women are often advised by lawyers not to mention violence in custody or visitation rights cases, for fear of being accused of sabotaging the child's contact with the other parent and facing the risk of losing custody. This way, mothers are unable to protect their children against violence. Perpetrators on the other hand are usually not expected to take responsibility or receive treatment.

In 2016, the courts entered into cooperation with municipalities within the framework of the "Uniform Assistance Offer" (Uniform Hulp Aanbod). In custody and visitation rights cases parents are referred to the municipality, which then seeks a (youth) assistance provider for parenting mediation and/or supervised visitation. However, domestic violence and child abuse

.

⁸¹ Lünnemann, K. D. (2023). <u>Verschillend perspectief, samen kijken</u>. Different perspectives, looking together.

are not discussed in this program; **raising these issues is considered to be unconstructive and unhelpful.**

This ultimately results in victims of gender-based violence losing confidence in the family law system and its corresponding institutions. The reprimand of a judge in August 2023 for pointing out that the family law system in the Netherlands fails to protect victims of domestic violence and child abuse further discourages victims from using the legal system that is supposed to protect them.⁸² The lack of knowledge and attention to domestic violence in family law has led to widespread 'systems abuse' by perpetrators invoking 'parental alienation.' This issue has been exacerbated by the 2021 Parental Alienation Expert Team (Expertteam Ouderverstoting) report in 2021, which places blame on mothers for parental alienation.

Prosecution

Article 48: Prohibition of mandatory alternative dispute resolution process or sentencing

Victims are pressured to participate in mediation

Currently, the idea prevails that parents must be able to work it out together without regard to power imbalances. Although there are opportunities for mediation in "lighter" cases (healing rather than re-traumatization) it should not be a general practice to be pushed. Victims are sometimes seriously pressured to participate in mediation cases; the same occurs if they want to quit during the course of the aforementioned "Uniform Assistance Offer" program. Victims are then told that it is their fault that it did not work out and that the judge will attach consequences. These types of programs are thus **voluntary on paper**, **but in practice participation is enforced by threatening the victim with consequences**, such as the replacement of children. In the government report it is highlighted that mediation is voluntary and joint parenting is not pursued if there is a history of violence or there are suspicions of violence (Art. 48, Q. 38). However, these assessments are rarely made, as described in the previous paragraphs. Consequently, access to justice is limited now that the government clearly favours mediation.

Moreover, new efforts are underway to roll out a new pilot, the so-called "Family Advocate". This concept is controversial within the legal profession as one of the core values of lawyers is partisanship and the interests of different family members can be in conflict.⁸³ The goal of the Family Advocate is to reach mutual agreements in high conflict divorce but it's evident that this approach may not be effective in cases involving coercive control.⁸⁴ Especially when there

Louwerse, P. (25-07-2023). <u>Klokkenluidersmelding en berisping: conflict rond rechter escaleert</u>.
 Access 4th July 2024. *Whistleblower reporting and reprimand: conflict surrounding judge escalates*.
 Avontuur, I., van Hoof, M-J. (14-06-2024). <u>Gezag en omgang in de context van dwingende controle/intieme terreur</u>. Nederlands Juristenblad, afl. 21. *Authority and intercourse in the context of coercive control/intimate terror*.

⁸⁴ Avontuur, I., van Hoof, M-J. (14-06-2024). <u>Gezag en omgang in de context van dwingende controle/intieme terreur</u>. Nederlands Juristenblad, afl. 21. Authority and intercourse in the context of coercive control/intimate terror.

is no analysis made of (physiological) violence patterns within the family.⁸⁵ Again, this method **ignores domestic violence** and focusses on the "Complex Divorce Methodology" (Methodiek Complexe Scheidingen), which is predicated on the assumption that domestic violence and child abuse do not play a role, but rather that parents are simply arguing in an immature way.

Article 49 and 50: General obligations and immediate response, prevention and protection

Hardly any gender-awareness in the judicial system

'Attorneys who represent victims of domestic violence in family law cases and who invoke the Istanbul Convention and/or the European Convention on Human Rights in their submissions to the court, very often report that **the court**, **in their decisions**, **fail to respond to claims made under the conventions**. References to the conventions are, in the experience of family attorneys, routinely ignored. To assess whether this is indeed common practice, and to get an empirically well-founded view of the way claims of domestic violence are handled in Dutch family courts, Research Institute Verwey-Jonker will carry out a survey among Dutch family law attorneys about their experiences with domestic violence-cases. The research is funded by a number of Dutch NGOs, among others the Vereniging voor Vrouw en Recht 'Clara Wichmann' (Association for Woman and Law 'Clara Wichmann'). The survey will be circulated in September 2024; research outcomes are expected in November/December 2024 and will be used to formulate recommendations for the treatment of domestic violence-cases in family courts.

As highlighted in the Dutch NGO Shadow Report on Istanbul Convention in 2018, there is insufficient recognition among police and justice officials that gender plays a significant role in both the types of crimes against women and men, as well as in how victims and perpetrators are treated. There is a notable **lack of understanding regarding power dynamics and hidden coercion mechanisms**, which often results in domestic violence being inadequately addressed as a 'conflict divorce' situation. Professionals in public prosecution, judges, and police officers, frequently emphasise shared responsibility between victims and perpetrators for the violence, suggesting that both parties need help. The government states in its report that court-appointed experts and legal professionals offer various courses on domestic violence through the training institute for judges (Art. 31, Q. 33a). However, as mentioned under SR Article 15, there appears to be no mandatory, structured training program for family judges (Art. 15 Q. 11).

Treatment of victims by the police: the need for specialised police officers

Every month, a child or adult dies in the Netherlands due to domestic violence. The police record approximately 84,000 incidents of domestic violence a year. 86 However, the actual number of incidents is likely much higher. As highlighted in the 2018 Dutch NGO Shadow Report on Istanbul Convention, one reason for this discrepancy is the way the police treat

⁸⁵ Avontuur, I., van Hoof, M-J. (14-06-2024). <u>Gezag en omgang in de context van dwingende controle/intieme terreur</u>. Nederlands Juristenblad, afl. 21. Authority and intercourse in the context of coercive control/intimate terror.

⁸⁶ Politie Nederland (n.d). <u>Hoe vaak komt huiselijk geweld voor?</u> Police Netherlands. *How often does domestic violence occur?* Accessed 5 July 2024.

victims. Experience shows significant disparities in how the police handle 'moral law' cases (those falling under criminal law on sexual offences, such as rape and sexual child abuse) compared to cases of domestic violence and stalking.

Reports of domestic violence or stalking must be filed with regular police, often resulting in negative experiences for victims. As recognised in the government report, the police and Public Prosecution Office do not have units that specifically focus on crimes and violence against women (Art. 49 and 50, Q. 42b). Victims report being sent away, discouraged from filing a complaint, told that the case is not serious enough, having the complaint refused, or seeing no further action taken by the police. When children are involved, charges - including serious offences such as stalking or nonfatal strangulation - are often dismissed "in the best interest of the child", with parents referred to mediation to resolve "their issues". Other complaints include a general attitude of distrust towards victims, accusations of making false statements, and victims facing stereotypes and prejudices.

Often there is a lack of sensitivity towards the victim's position, their dependence on the perpetrator and the safety risks involved, especially when the perpetrator finds out that the victim has pressed charges. Complaints about domestic violence and other forms of gender-based violence should always be handled by a specialised police officer with expertise in domestic violence and related crimes, and who are trained to assess safety risks.

The above described problems have worsened since the reorganisation of the police into one national force, as highlighted in the Dutch NGO Shadow Report on Istanbul Convention in 2018. This reorganisation has resulted in a significant loss of expertise on domestic violence and other forms of gender-based violence. Although there are initiatives aimed at improving the situation, the problem persists. In short, the judicial system makes women responsible for their own safety and that of their children. Police stations in different cities do not exchange information with each other. Consequently, if a victim moves to another city or goes to a shelter there, the local police are unaware of the situation. This lack of communication seriously hinders the protection of victims, especially since perpetrators often manage to track down their victims in other cities or towns.

Fear of negative consequences of reporting violence to the police: need for a 'safe reporting' policy

All victims should be able to safely report violence to the police, regardless of their residence status, work status or other circumstances, without fear that their personal data will be shared with other agencies or private entities, such as the immigration police, tax department, child protection agencies, employers, housing associations, or landlords. Additionally, victims should be able to trust that their complaints will be taken seriously and that they will be treated respectfully.

Insofar they exist, **safe reporting guarantees for undocumented migrants are not formally recognised** in national legislation and are largely unknown to both police and migrants.⁸⁷ This

⁸⁷ Timmerman, R., Leerkes, A., Staring, R. (2019). <u>Safe reporting of crime for victims and witnesses with irregular migration status in the Netherlands</u>. Compas, Global Exchange on Migration and Diversity, University of Oxford;

Wijntuin, P. (2023) <u>Country report about pioneering strategies on safe reporting of crime - City of Utrecht</u>. Safe Reporting.

can lead to the deportation of undocumented victims if they come into contact with the authorities.

Article 51: Risk assessment and risks management

Risk assessments are not a standard part of the response to domestic violence, nor in custody or visitation right cases

Article 51(1) of the Istanbul Convention is not complied with in practice, which is not mentioned in the government report. The carrying out of a risk assessment is not included in the standard response to domestic violence or intimate terrorism, nor is it included in decisions on custody and visitation rights. In family law cases, convictions for domestic violence under criminal law, or problems occurring in the perpetrator's other relationships are ignored. Research of police files on intimate partner violence shows that the domestic violence cases brought to the Public Prosecution Service (OM) mostly involve physical violence where little to no injury has occurred.⁸⁸ In half of the cases, the incident was the first one reported to the police. Legally speaking, this does not constitute serious violence: the suspect is a first offender of a minor crime. High levels of controlling behaviour, which have the highest predictive value for a potentially severe or even fatal outcome, are often dismissed.

Although legally it may concern a minor offence, this does not preclude the need for a risk assessment, given the **escalating character of domestic violence**, as known by justice professionals and police officers specialised in domestic violence. They are acquainted with the risk factors and know that cases of intimate partner violence may start with a 'minor offence' but can develop into much more serious crimes.

Risk assessments using the so-called SASH method (Screening Assessment for Stalking and Harassment) are only conducted after the victim has filed a stalking report. **The reporting of stalking is often a long and difficult process.** Additionally, stalking is not frequently recognized as such. For example, vandalism or the creation of fake online profiles is assessed separately by the police.

Femicide

As discussed in the previous paragraphs, there are several bottlenecks in the prevention and investigation of femicide reports. These include a lack of specialised police officers and insufficient sensitivity towards victims. Furthermore, risk assessments are not routinely integrated into responses to domestic violence, leading to the frequent oversight of high levels of controlling behaviour. This is especially concerning since **femicide often follows a clear timeline with identifiable patterns that need to be analysed and mapped**. However, as recognised in the government report, not all cases of femicide are retrospectively analysed (Art. 51, Q. 50). The shooting in Zwijndrecht is a sad but clear example in which all red flags

⁸⁸ Lünneman, K., Drost, L., Jansma, A., Lünnemann, M. (2016). <u>The Protection of IPV victims: file analysis and victim interviews - The Netherlands</u>. Verwey-Jonker Instituut, INASC. Improving Needs Assessment and Victim Support in Domestic Violence Related Criminal Proceedings, co-financed by the Criminal Justice Program of the EU, p.5.

were missed, including the possession of firearms, despite Article 51(2) of the Convention emphasising that this significantly increases the risk of a fatal ending.⁸⁹ The new "Femicide Plan" and its shortcomings will be discussed in the next "emerging trends" section.

Article 52: Emergency barring orders and Article 53: Restraining or protection orders

Emergency barring orders are not effective enough

The emergency barring order can be helpful for a victim, as a kind of time-out. However, it is often only an interim solution when it should be integrated in a longer process. **Additional long-term tools are needed.** Currently, the emergency barring order is linked to a location and the current partner. This does not provide sufficient protection against ex-partners and in cases where the victim has moved away. This is contrary to the European Directive on violence against women and domestic violence, 90 which states that these types of order should follow the family instead of a location or the partner. Problems also persist in the context of custody and visitation rights after a divorce, where parents are forced to talk to each other. GREVIO stated in its baseline evaluation of 2020 that there are no proper follow-up procedures after the emergency barring order ends, leaving gaps in protection precisely when the risks are highest.

Article 55: Measures of protection

The protection of the privacy of the victim is not properly safeguarded

The privacy of the victim is not properly safeguarded by either the police or aid services. The privacy legislation (AVG) is often used as an excuse to avoid data collection 'to protect the privacy of the offender'. During the prosecution investigation, certain evidence can be difficult to access. On the other hand, sensitive information such as the addresses of victims of gender based violence are included in judicial documents that are sent both to the victim and perpetrator, disregarding the safety of the victim.

⁸⁹ NOS (15-05-2024). <u>Levenslang geëist tegen 'Lucky' wegens fatale schietpartij Zwijndrecht.</u> *Life sentence demanded against 'Lucky' for fatal Zwijndrecht shooting.* Accessed 4 July 2024.

⁹⁰ Directive (EU) (14-05-2024). <u>On combating violence against women and domestic violence</u>. 2024/1385 of the European Parliament and of the Council.

PART III: Emerging trends on violence against women and domestic violence

Article 56

Digital manifestations of violence against women

Research and practice indicate a significant rise in online violence targeting women and girls. Reports highlight that women politicians, in particular, are increasingly subjected to hate speech, threats and intimidation on social media and other online platforms. These attacks can escalate to physical threats and violence, severely impacting their behaviour, functioning, and ability to participate freely in public discourse. In extreme cases, it leads women politicians to withdraw from politics altogether. A concerning trend is the emergence of digital violence through apps that enable ex-partners to track their ex-wives or access their personal information, such as bank accounts.

Research on the implementation of GREVIO's General Recommendation 1 regarding the digital dimension of violence against women indicates that efforts to address this issue are still in early stages. 93 There is increasing awareness of the diverse forms of digital violence and its rapid evolution, both its impact on victims and its broader societal implications are becoming more recognized. However, as noted by the researchers, the government policy is characterised by the same fragmentation, reinforced by the decentralisation of policy to the local level, and relative unfamiliarity with the issue as the general approach to violence against women. There are also few dedicated efforts to effectively investigate and prosecute such crimes. Existing initiatives face legal complexities, capacity constraints, and a shortage of specialised knowledge. The study emphasised the urgent need for a coordinated national approach that consolidates existing knowledge, enhances capacity (both in terms of expertise and workforce and in terms of protection, prosecution and prevention), and integrates strategies for addressing online and offline violence against women into national and local government policies. This approach should also align with efforts to combat cybercrime. It is crucial to improve the protection of victims of online violence and strengthen prevention measures across society, involving both citizens and professionals. Prevention should include educating young people about how to protect themselves from online violence and how to deal with it when they are victims.

Amendment of the Sexual Offences Act

As of July 1, the Sexual Offences Act will be amended. In addition to what is already punishable, the new law also criminalises sexual contact with someone against their will. This is an important step in the fight against sexual violence and for supporting its victims.

⁹¹ Atria (2024). <u>"Ga aardappelen schillen of zoiets" - Onderzoek naar de omvang, aard en gevolgen van online agressie en geweld tegen vrouwelijke politici in Nederland.</u> "Go peel potatoes or so" - Research into the extent, nature, and consequences of online aggression and violence against women politicians in the Netherlands.

⁹² Runderkamp, Z. (2023). <u>Barrières voor vrouwen om politiek actief te worden, zijn en blijven</u>. Alliantie Politica. *Barriers for women to become, are and to stay politically active.*

⁹³ Korf, W., Harthoorn, H., Witvliet, M. (2023). <u>Digitale dimensie van geweld tegen vrouwen.</u>
<u>Opvolging Algemene Aanbeveling nr. 1 GREVIO, Eindrapport.</u> Digital dimension of violence against women. Follow up recommendation nr. 1 Grevio, Final report. Amsterdam: Regioplan.

Victims will therefore soon be able to report rape and sexual assault in more cases. Public sexual harassment will also become punishable; this can occur off line on the street, as well as online on public websites and social media. Additionally, sex chatting will become punishable, the maximum penalties for some offences will be increased, and the law will be updated to reflect digital advancements. The NGO's are pleased with this significant development which brings the law into line with international human rights treaties. It is important that municipalities use the new law to strengthen their prevention policies. Prevention remains the main pillar of tackling street harassment. Municipalities must clearly establish that street harassment and sexually transgressive behaviour against girls and women are unacceptable in order to change the social norm. Moreover, the message emphasised by the new law must be conveyed through campaigns and education in schools. The Dutch government made a good start with the campaign "Together we draw the line" (Met elkaar trekken we de grens).

New Plan of Action "Stop Femicide' lacks substantial impact

On June 7 2024, the administration published the Action Plan "Stop Femicide!". However, the Action Plan does not explicitly criminalise psychological violence. Psychological violence, such as coercive control, often precedes femicide, making this a significant oversight. While the new action plan reiterates ongoing studies on the criminalisation of psychological violence, the completion of these studies will take years. Criminalisation is not ruled out in the future, but the new plan once again delays possible legislative changes. However, four years ago the Dutch government stated that it believed the current legal framework was sufficient to prosecute psychological violence.

NGOs also criticise the **absence of a national coordinator for violence against women**, which is needed to oversee the fragmented policies. Moreover, **without any allocated funding, plans on paper become ineffective in practice.** Projects included in the action plan either lack funding, will soon face cuts, or are set to end in the near future. In the government report, it is stated that the plan of action "highlights" the importance of recognizing early warning signs (Art. 7, Q. 1), indeed 'Stop Femicide' merely highlights issues without creating substantial impact.

New project to strengthen the temporary restraining orders

There is a new project to strengthen the application of temporary restraining orders.⁹⁵ Currently, there are **significant regional differences** in how these orders are implemented; some municipalities are performing better than others but the regional differences are large.

Extension mandate independent Commissioner

Since 2022 The Netherlands has a specific commissioner for combating inappropriate behaviour and sexual violence. We call for the duration of the Sexual Violence Action

⁹⁴ Amnesty International (2024). *Statement Amnesty International: Stel psychisch geweld expliciet strafbaar in Nederland. Statement Amnesty International: Explicitly criminalise psychological violence in the Netherlands.*

⁹⁵ Ministerie van Justitie en Veiligheid (24-03-2024). <u>Het tijdelijk huisverbod vanuit een nieuw perspectief: Analyse van de knelpunten en concrete voorstellen voor een verbeterde werkwijze van de Wet tijdelijk huisverbod.</u> Ministry of Justice and Security. The temporary restraining order from a new perspective: Analysis of the bottlenecks and concrete proposals for an improved working method of the Temporary Restraining Order Act.

programme to be extended on a long-term basis and for its **scope to be broadened to include all forms of violence against women** to strengthen the mandate of the Government's Independent Commissioner. More specifically, attention should be given to the issues refugees are confronted with, which is currently not included in the National Action Plan Against Sexual Violence.

Ratification of the ILO 190 Convention is taking a long time

The government has announced its intention to ratify the ILO Convention 190, The Right of Everyone to a World of Work Free from Violence and Harassment, but the process is taking a long time. Moreover, the **government is aiming for minimal implementation**, with no changes in policies in the Netherlands planned to enforce the ILO Convention 190.

Bill on forced registration of sex workers

Despite the objections of CEDAW (2010), sex workers, social workers, health services, lawyers, and the negative advice of the Council of State⁹⁶ and the Data Protection Authority, ⁹⁷ as well as the previous rejection of a similar bill by the Senate, the government has reintroduced two bills on compulsory registration of sex workers. The first bill (Wrs: Act on the regulation of sex work) raises the legal age for sex work to 21, requires sex workers to register in a national database and criminalises clients and working relationships of nonregistered sex workers. It also obliges sex workers to undergo a mandatory intake interview with two officials who must decide whether they are sufficiently 'resilient' to be granted a state licence to do sex work. The second bill (Wgts: Act on the Municipal Supervision of Sex Work) authorises municipalities and brothel owners to register sex workers in the local database, including data on their racial or ethnic origin, health, sexual behaviour and sexual orientation. Forced registration violates sex workers' privacy, risks involuntary outing, social exclusion and loss of future work perspectives, and exacerbates stigma and discrimination. Experience in Germany, which introduced compulsory registration in 2017, shows that five years later, fewer than 15% of sex workers have registered. Large numbers of sex workers have moved from the legal to the illegal sector and trafficking has not decreased.98

Sex worker, social, health and human rights organisations fear that rather than protecting sex workers the Wrs (and Wgts) will **put (unregistered) sex workers at greater risk of violence and exploitation, and cut them off from health and social services, as well as access to the police in the event of violence.** In addition, a growing body of research shows that the criminalisation of consensual adult sex work, including of clients, has a negative impact on the safety, health, wellbeing and rights of sex workers.⁹⁹

⁹⁶ Advies Raad van State Wet Regulering Sekswerk, W16.20.0238/II, 27 January 2021, Kamerstukken II 2020/21, 35715, nr. 4.

⁹⁷ Advies Autoriteit Persoonsgegevens Wet regulering sekswerk, 23 June 2020.

⁹⁸ Henning, J., Hunecke, I., & Walentowitz, G. (2021). <u>Das Prostituiertenschutzgesetz im Lichte der Kriminalitätsstatistik: Vom Inkrafttreten des ProstSchG bis zur Covid-19-Krise</u>. Monatsschrift für Kriminologie und Strafrechtsreform, 104(4), pp- 359–374.

⁹⁹ Amnesty International (2016). <u>The human cost of "crushing" the market: criminalization of sex work in Norway;</u>

Amnesty International (2022). "We live within a violent system. Structural violence against sex workers in Ireland;

Dodillet, S., Östergen, P. (2011). <u>The Swedish sex purchase act: Claimed success and documented</u> effects;

Access to asylum and international protection for women victims of violence against women

Asylum procedures fall short of international standards set out in the Istanbul Convention and CEDAW. They **fail to recognise (sexual) trauma** and, contrary to the OHCHR¹⁰⁰ and the EU Court of Justice¹⁰¹, **do not recognise 'gender' as a separate ground of persecution** under the 1951 Refugee Convention.¹⁰² While the government has announced policy changes to allow for the recognition of women under the 'social group' persecution ground, in line with recent ECJ case law, it has stated that this change "is unlikely to result in a higher level of protection for women, as women are often granted subsidiary protection under current policy anyway".¹⁰³ The government report also states that it is not expected that this judgement will lead to a different level of protection (Art. 56, Q. 56e). However, according to the decision of the State Secretary for Justice and Security, this judgement can lead to the conclusion that refugee status may be granted within the meaning of the Refugee Convention if the violence qualifies as an act of persecution under Article 3.36 VV (Foreigners Regulation 2000).¹⁰⁴ This judgement will thus effectively amend the regulation.

'Safe-country-of-origin' policies and the application of the principle of non-refoulement do not take into account the situation in regard to violence against women in the country concerned, for example in the case of FGM or femicide. 105

In the asylum procedure, **female interviewers and interpreters are not always available**, nor are they always adequately trained to recognise signs of sexual violence. In addition, lawyers are not involved in the initial interview and legal aid providers are not always adequately trained.

procedures.

Le Bail, H. et al. (2018). What do sex workers think about the French Prostitution Act? A study on the Impact of the Law of 13 April 2016 against the "Prostitution System" in France;

Platt, L., Grenfell, P., Meiksin, R., Elmes, J., Sherman, S. G., Sanders, T. & Crago, A. L. (2018). <u>Associations between sex work laws and sex workers' health: A systematic review and meta-analysis of quantitative and qualitative studies.</u> PLoS medicine, 15(12), e1002680;

Sweetman, B. (2015). *Is the criminalisation of the purchase of sex (the Swedish model) consistent* with the European Convention on Human Rights? In LAWPUBL 751: Comparative Human Rights.

¹⁰⁰ UNHCR (2002). Guidelines on International Protection No. 1: Gender-Related Persecution Within the Context of Article 1A(2) of the 1951 Convention and/or its 1967 Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees.

¹⁰¹ EU Court of Justice (21024), case C-621/21, 16 Jan 2024.

¹⁰² Amnesty International (2023). <u>Seksueel geweld: blinde vlek in de asielprocedure.</u> Victims of sexual violence: blind spot in the asylum process.

¹⁰³ Parliamentary papers (05-03-2024). <u>Brief wijzigingen beoordelingskader asielaanvraag</u>. Government letter to parliament. *Letter amendments assessment framework asylum applications*, p.11.

houdende wijziging van de Vreemdelingencirculaire 2000. Decision of the State Secretary for Justice and Security of 13 June 2024, number WBV 2024/12, amending the Immigration Circular 2000.

105 Vrouwen tegen Uitzetting (2023). VTU luidt noodklok over vrouwonvriendelijke asielprocedures.

Women against Deportation. Women against deportation raises alarm over misogynistic asylum